



SYSTEMS IN ACTION: TANZANIA

JANUARY | 2017

Education systems are large, complex organizations that encompass not only various sets of actors and inputs, but also the relationships that allow those actors and units to work together. When standards, rules, accountability relationships and financing levels are aligned towards shared education goals, the education system as a whole, in all its complexity and size, is coherent and able to perform well. Improving learning outcomes therefore requires much more than simply increasing resources; education systems must be strengthened at the component and the system level, to help equip children, youth and adults with knowledge and skills for life.

The World Bank helps countries ensure "Learning for All" through support to countries on both the financing and knowledge fronts. The Education Global Practice within the World Bank champions a systems approach, by holistically evaluating which education policies and programs are most likely to create quality learning environments and improve student performance, especially among the disadvantaged and excluded.

Achieving education goals

Over the course of the last several years, Tanzania has made significant strides in improving access to education. The Tanzania Development Vision 2025 defines the country's goal to become a middle-income country by 2025, emphasizing a necessary expansion in access to education to ultimately create an adequately qualified and trained workforce to advance rapid economic growth.¹ As of 2001, only about 60 percent of children completed primary school and secondary school gross enrollment rate was at a low 8 percent. Overall, the education system was performing far below the level needed for sustainable development.²

In response, the government took on an overall sector development approach, focusing specifically on primary education. With the World Bank's International Development Association (IDA) financing and additional support from other partners, the Primary Education Development Program (PEDP) was created in 2001 to expand school access and increase school completion at the primary level.³ Through the PEDP, tuition fees were abolished and primary schools were expanded throughout the country. Between 2001 and 2006, enrolment increased from 61 percent to 96 percent, surpassing the international average for primary enrolment (89 percent).⁴

¹ Planning Commission. 1999. The Tanzania Development Vision 2025. Dodoma: United Republic of Tanzania.

² "IDA at work: Education. Education Outcomes Improve in Tanzania," <http://intranet.worldbank.org/WBSITE/INTRANET/INTCOUNTRIES/INTAFRICA/INTTANZANIA/0,,contentMDK:21273360~menuPK:51550116~pagePK:145897~piPK:147055~theSitePK:258433,00.html>

³ Ibid

⁴ Engaging the private sector in education, Tanzania Country Report (2015)

Photo: Sarah Farhat / World Bank



Tanzania's Ministry of Education, Science and Technology (MoEST) has abolished other fees that may have been preventing students from attending school. In 2016, the government introduced the Free Basic Education Policy, which extended free education to the lower secondary school level, eliminating tuition and other fees through grade 10, and any 'hidden' indirect fees in primary education that may have been discouraging primary school students to attend.

In 2004, Tanzania embarked on the Secondary Education Development Program (SEDP) with IDA financing, emphasizing building schools in every ward, predominantly because the bulge in primary enrollments from the PEDP created pressure on secondary schools with already limited seats.⁵ At the time, Tanzania had the lowest secondary gross enrollment ratio in Sub-Saharan Africa and secondary enrollment ratios were low for all population groups, especially for low-income youth and students in rural areas, with few established Government schools.⁶ The SEDP aimed to increase the number of students completing lower and upper secondary education, especially for underserved groups, improve learning outcomes of students, especially girls, and strengthen the management of secondary education through the delegation of authority to lower levels, all too great success. Between 2005 and 2010, enrollment in secondary schools almost quadrupled (Joshi 2015).

Although educational opportunities have expanded for a great number of students, learning outcomes struggled to hold steady. In 2012, only 31 percent of those who sat for the Tanzanian Primary School Leaving Examination (PSLE) exams passed, down from 52 percent in 2008. At the secondary level, the passing rate of the Certificate of Secondary Education Examination (CSEE) had also declined, from 84 percent in 2008 to 43 percent in 2012. However learning indicators have begun to significantly improve, with pass rates for the PSLE and CSEE exams rising to 67.8 percent and 68 percent respectively in 2015, the highest it has been for the past five years. In addition, the national average of reading words per minute in Kiswahili for Grade 2 students increased from 17.9 in 2013, to 23.6 words per minute in 2016, outperforming even the end-target of 21.9 words per minute which had been expected in 2018.



PHOTO:
SARAH FARHAT / WORLD
BANK

The impact of partnerships

Throughout the Bank's partnership with Tanzania, several programs and tools have been used to inform investments and reforms in the area of education. For example, recognizing that rapid enrollment placed primary and secondary school systems under increased pressure and declining learning outcomes, the MoEST launched a multi-sectoral program called "Big Results Now" (BRN) which was shaped by the analysis from the Systems Approach for Better Education Results (SABER) tool specifically designed to assess teacher policies (SABER-Teachers). The SABER-teachers engagement helped identify underlying causes and key areas for reform in teacher policy. Under BRN, the MoEST will rank all secondary schools annually

⁵ *Ibid*

⁶ *Implementation completion and results report, SEDP 2008*

http://imagebank.worldbank.org/servlet/WDSContentServer/IB/2008/07/30/000333037_20080730002559/Rendered/PDF/ICR7440ICR0P081sclosed0July02802008.pdf



based on national exams. The World Bank's Strategic Impact Evaluation Fund (SIEF) is helping to evaluate the impact of this program together with a pilot intervention that directly rewards teachers for improved student test scores.

The MoEST has been engaging with other SABER domain tools, including Engaging the Private Sector (SABER-EPS) to help raise the capacity and access to secondary schools. The SABER-EPS analysis recommended considering public-private partnerships at the secondary level to promote equity for low income and marginalized students, while ensuring that the regulatory environment promotes consistent quality in existing non-state schools. Following a stakeholders' workshop in Dar es Salaam in November 2014, the MoEST formed a secretariat composed of government and private sector representatives to coordinate and advance a SABER-EPS policy implementation analysis. The responding report detailed how the private sector could help Tanzania expand secondary education access, supporting Tanzania's vision of becoming a middle-income country by 2025.

To achieve middle-income status, Tanzania also has to ensure it has the right mix of high-quality skills to drive further growth and accommodate the large numbers of young people entering the labour force every year. The SABER-Workforce Development study found that the use of information for monitoring and forecasting of skills supply and demand were two of the weakest system functions in Tanzania compared to other countries. The primary challenge lay in incentivizing more regular, reliable and comprehensive data collection that is say, easily accessible on a web-based platform. Such an information system would make skills data readily available for demand and supply analysis.

The Education and Skills for Productive Jobs (ESPJ) project, signed in 2016, will support the government's strategic system level reform on skills development and use innovative financing mechanisms to increase the quality, relevance and accountability of skills training provision in key economic sectors. The ESPJ Program for Results (PforR) project builds on a track record of collaboration between the Government of Tanzania and the World Bank on results-based financing, which includes the BRN program. Use of the PforR aligns with the Government's desire to leverage this mechanism and amplify its own efforts to strengthen technical and institutional capacity. Given its wide experience with results-based financing, the World Bank is seen as a trusted partner to help institutionalize such a results-based development culture.⁷

At the tertiary education level in Tanzania, the World Bank has supported improving the targeting and effectiveness of the student loans scheme and the efficiency of the higher education application process, through the development of an online central admissions platform financed by the recently closed Science and Technology Higher Education Program and Additional Financing (STHEP and STHEP-AF).

Beyond policy implications, poor learning outcomes can point to failures in service delivery. As shown by the 2010 Service Delivery Indicators (SDI), which were piloted in Tanzania, there is considerable scarcity and misallocation in the provision of resources. On average, only 3% of Tanzanian primary schools had access to basic infrastructure services,⁸ teachers were absent from the classroom more than half the time, and on average students were only taught only 2 hours a day. Class sizes in Tanzania were very large as well due to resource constraints and a shortage of teachers. The student-teacher ratio was 48.7 students per teacher across all urban and rural schools (SDI 2012).

Such disadvantages tend to aggregate. According to the SABER Engaging the Private Sector (EPS) report, girls living in rural areas and from poorer households are not able to access education as readily as boys so. In 2012, for every 100 wealthy urban boys that completed primary school, only 53 poor rural girls were able to do so. Children from wealthier households are also over six times more likely to be enrolled in secondary schools compared to their poorer counterparts (EPS 2015).

⁷ Program Appraisal Document for the Education And Skills For Productive Jobs Program-For-Results, May 2016

⁸ The "infrastructure" indicator in the SDI refers to the availability of classroom electricity, school water and school sanitation.



In terms of women in the teacher labour force, Tanzania has succeeded in achieving gender parity for teachers in its primary education system. According to the SDI report, women constituted 50 percent of the primary school teacher body. The SDI data also examined correlations between teachers' gender and pupils' test performance. The results showed that boys scored worse in mathematics with a female teacher. However, the better a teacher performed on both the English and mathematics assessments, the higher girls' scores were in mathematics. Finally, the more female teachers there were in the school, the better girls performed in English, but boys' performance was not affected.⁹

Tanzania repeated the SDI exercise in 2014. In terms of access to basic infrastructure there was no noticeable improvement in the four years since the first SDI. Only 2 percent of the schools had electricity, clean water, and improved sanitation in 2014, down from 3 percent in 2010. There was impressive progress with school absence for teachers, which dropped from 23 percent in 2010 to 14 percent in 2014, a 40 percent reduction. However, it was disappointing that although classroom absence for teachers decreased from 53 percent to 47 percent, the decline was not statistically significant and, therefore, about half of the teachers were still not in the classroom. The reduction in teacher absence rates benefitted pupils who, between 2010 and 2014, gained 43 minutes of teaching time per day. Over the school year (an average of 194 days), this was a gain of 24 full teaching days. Most impressively, urban pupils doubled their teacher contact time from 47 days in 2010 to 94 days in 2014. However, one must keep in mind that Tanzanian primary pupils are still losing more than half of their allotted teaching time.

Education as an investment

Recognizing the importance of education for its economic development, Tanzania has increased its investment in the education sector over the past decades. Through IDA financing and other World Bank initiatives such as ESPJ, STHEP and STHEP-AF and BRN, and innovative financing instruments such as PforR, the country has implemented substantive reforms in increasing access to primary and secondary education, earning a return on this investment as primary completion rates increased from 55 percent in 2000 to over 90 percent in 2012, and as secondary completion rates increased from 35 percent in 2000 to 90 percent in 2012. Gender parity has also been achieved in primary education and girls are closing the gap in terms of secondary school enrollment. SABER analyses and SDI results, such as the fact that in 2014 the teacher absenteeism rate went down from its 2010 level, have guided and shaped the direction of policy implementation and reform. It is now widely agreed that it is important to invest in the quality of learning. The MoEST has already started this process in collaboration with the World Bank and other partners, to provide quality education for its citizens, to be realized as its next big achievement and a smart way to improve value-for-money of education public spending.

⁹ Tanzania, *Service Delivery Indicators, 2012*